

March 10, 2020

Governor's Office of Planning & Research

MAR 12 2020

STATE CLEARINGHOUSE

Gina Gibson-Williams
Community Development Director
City of Eastvale
12363 Limonite Avenue
Eastvale, California 91752

Dear Gina Gibson-Williams:

Thank you for providing the California Air Resources Board (CARB) with the opportunity to comment on the Homestead Industrial Project (Project) Draft Environmental Impact Report (DEIR), State Clearinghouse No. 2019090335. The project includes the development of 6 industrial-use buildings totaling 1,080,060 square feet. Once in operation, the Project would introduce up to 2,102 daily vehicle trips, including 408 daily heavy-duty truck trips, along local roadways. The Project is located within the City of Eastvale (City), California, which is the lead agency for California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) purposes.

The industrial uses proposed under the Project would permit warehousing and distribution facilities. Freight facilities, such as warehouse and distribution, can result in high daily volumes of heavy-duty diesel truck traffic and operation of on-site equipment (e.g., forklifts, yard tractors, etc.) which emit toxic diesel emissions and contribute to regional air pollution and global climate change.¹ CARB has reviewed the DEIR and is concerned about the air pollution impacts that would result should the City approve the Project.

I. The Project Would Increase Exposure to Air Pollution in Disadvantaged Communities

The Project, if approved, will expose nearby disadvantaged communities to elevated levels of air pollution. Residences are located northeast and south of the Project with the closest residences located approximately 280 feet from the Project's northeastern boundary. In addition to residences, two schools (Rosa Parks Elementary School and Dr. Augustine Ramirez Intermediate School) are located within 1 mile of the Project area. The community is surrounded by existing toxic diesel particulate matter (diesel PM) emission sources, which include existing industrial sources and vehicular traffic along Interstate 15 (I-15). Due to the Project's proximity to residences and

¹ With regard to greenhouse gas emissions from this project, CARB has been clear that local governments and project proponents have a responsibility to properly mitigate these impacts. CARB's guidance, set out in detail in the Scoping Plan issued in 2017, makes clear that in CARB's expert view local mitigation is critical to achieving climate goals and reducing greenhouse gases below levels of significance.

schools already disproportionately burdened by multiple sources of air pollution, CARB is concerned with the potential cumulative health impacts associated with the construction and operation of the Project.

The State of California has placed additional emphasis on protecting local communities from the harmful effects of air pollution through the passage of Assembly Bill 617 (AB 617) (Garcia, Chapter 136, Statutes of 2017). AB 617 is a significant piece of air quality legislation that highlights the need for further emission reductions in communities with high exposure burdens, like those in which the Project is located. Diesel PM emissions generated during the construction and operation of the Project would negatively impact the community, which is already disproportionately impacted by air pollution from existing industrial sources and traffic on I-15.

Through its authority under Health and Safety Code section 39711, the California Environmental Protection Agency (CalEPA) is charged with the duty to identify disadvantaged communities. CalEPA bases its identification of these communities on geographic, socioeconomic, public health, and environmental hazard criteria (Health and Safety Code, section 39711, subsection (a)). In this capacity, CalEPA currently defines a disadvantaged community, from an environmental hazard and socioeconomic standpoint, as a community that scores within the top 25 percent of the census tracts, as analyzed by the California Communities Environmental Health Screening Tool Version 3.0 (CalEnviroScreen). CalEnviroScreen uses a screening methodology to help identify California communities currently disproportionately burdened by multiple sources of pollution. The census tract containing the Project is within the top 20 percent for Pollution Burden² and is considered a disadvantaged community; therefore, CARB urges the City to ensure that the Project does not adversely impact neighboring disadvantaged communities.

² Pollution Burden represents the potential exposures to pollutants and the adverse environmental conditions caused by pollution.

II. It is Unclear Whether the Proposed Warehouse and Distribution Facilities Include Cold Storage

The air pollutant emissions reported in the DEIR were estimated under the assumption that the Project would not be used for cold storage. Since the Project description in the DEIR did not explicitly state that the proposed 1,080,060 square feet of warehousing, distribution, and retail uses would not include cold storage space, there is a possibility that trucks and trailers visiting the Project site would be equipped with transport refrigeration units (TRU).^{3,4}

TRUs on trucks and trailers can emit large quantities of diesel exhaust while operating within the Project site. Residences and other sensitive receptors (e.g., daycare facilities, senior care facilities, and schools) located near where these TRUs could be operating would be exposed to diesel exhaust emissions that would result in significant cancer risk. CARB staff urges the applicant and City to revise the DEIR to clearly define the Project's description, so the public can fully understand the potential environmental effects of the Project on their communities.

If the Project will not be used for cold storage, CARB staff urges the City to include one of the following design measures in the Final Environmental Impact Report (FEIR):

- A Project design measure requiring contractual language in tenant lease agreements that prohibits tenants from operating TRUs within the Project site; or
- A condition requiring a restrictive covenant over the parcel that prohibits the applicant's use of TRUs on the property unless the applicant seeks and receives an amendment to its conditional use permit allowing such use.

If the City does allow TRUs within the Project site, CARB staff urges the City to model air pollutant emissions from on-site TRUs in the FEIR, as well as prepare a health risk assessment (HRA) that shows the potential health risks. The FEIR should also include the air pollutant reduction measures listed in Attachment A.

³ TRUs are refrigeration systems powered by integral diesel engines that protect perishable goods during transport in an insulated truck and trailer vans, rail cars, and domestic shipping containers.

⁴ Project descriptions "must include (a) the precise location and boundaries of the proposed project, (b) a statement of the objectives sought by the proposed project, (c) a general description of the project's technical, economic and environmental characteristics, and (d) a statement briefly describing the intended use of the EIR." (*stopthemillenniumhollywood.com v. City of Los Angeles* (2019) 39 Cal.App.5th 1, 16.) "This description of the project is an indispensable element of both a valid draft EIR and final EIR." (*Ibid.*) Without explicit acknowledgment in the project description that the proposed project will not include cold storage facilities, the current project description fails to meet the bare minimum of describing the project's technical and environmental characteristics.

III. The DEIR Fails to Include Enforceable Mitigation Measures to Reduce the Project's Air Pollutant Emissions

CARB is concerned about the overall lack of mitigation measures found in the DEIR. Without modeling the Project's mitigated operational air pollutant emissions, the DEIR concludes that the Project's operational emissions of nitrogen oxides (NO_x) will remain significant and unavoidable. The DEIR includes mitigation measures AQ-1 through AQ-4 to reduce the Project's operational NO_x emissions. These mitigation measures restrict truck idling to 5 minutes, encourage trucks visiting the facility to incorporate energy efficiency improvements, incorporate electric vehicle charging and carpooling, and provide infrastructure to support the use of electric-powered forklifts. Although the proposed mitigation measures listed in the DEIR would reduce the Project's operational NO_x emissions, more can be done. CEQA requires that all feasible mitigation measures be incorporated even where impacts will remain significant and unavoidable after mitigation (see California Public Resources Code § 21081; 14 CCR § 15126.2(b)). Therefore, as required under CEQA, the Project's mitigated air pollutant emissions should be quantified and reported in the FEIR, so the public has a better understanding of the potential impacts the Project will have on local air quality. In addition to the mitigation measures already in the DEIR, CARB strongly urges the City to implement the air pollutant emission reduction measures found in Attachment A.

IV. Conclusion

CARB is concerned about the Project's potential public health impacts and the lack of mitigation measures presented in the DEIR. The DEIR does not provide mitigation measures to reduce the Project's operational air pollution emissions, and does not evaluate the Project's potential air quality and health effects from on-site TRUs. CARB recommends that the City reanalyze the Project's air quality and health risk impacts that accounts for all on-site emission sources and include the air pollution emission measures provided in Attachment A in the FEIR.

Given the breadth and scope of projects subject to CEQA review throughout California that have air quality and greenhouse gas impacts coupled with CARB's limited staff resources to substantively respond to all issues associated with a project, CARB must prioritize its substantive comments here based on staff time, resources, and its assessment of impacts. CARB's deliberate decision to substantively comment on some issues does not constitute an admission or concession that it substantively agrees with the lead agency's findings and conclusions on any issues on which CARB does not substantively submit comments.

Gina Gibson-Williams

March 10, 2020

Page 5

CARB appreciates the opportunity to comment on the DEIR for the Project and can provide assistance on zero-emission technologies and emission reduction strategies, as needed. If you have questions, please contact Stanley Armstrong, Air Pollution Specialist, at (916) 440-8242 or via email at stanley.armstrong@arb.ca.gov.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in blue ink that reads "Richard Boyd". The signature is fluid and cursive, with the first name "Richard" and last name "Boyd" clearly legible.

Richard Boyd, Chief
Risk Reduction Branch
Transportation and Toxics Division

Attachment

cc: See next page.

Gina Gibson-Williams

March 10, 2020

Page 6

cc: State Clearinghouse
P.O. Box 3044
Sacramento, California 95812

Carlo De La Cruz
Senior Campaign Representative
Sierra Club
714 West Olympic Boulevard, Suite 1000
Los Angeles, California 90015

Lijin Sun
Program Supervisor
CEQA Intergovernmental Review
South Coast Air Quality Management District
lsun@aqmd.gov

Morgan Capilla
NEPA Reviewer
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
Air Division, Region 9
75 Hawthorne Street
San Francisco, California 94105

Taylor Thomas
Research and Policy Analyst
East Yard Communities for Environmental Justice
2317 South Atlantic Boulevard
Commerce, California 90040

Andrea Vidaurre
Policy Analyst
Center for Community Action and Environmental Justice
P.O. Box 33124
Riverside, California 92519

Stanley Armstrong
Air Pollution Specialist
Risk Analysis Section
Transportation and Toxics Division

ATTACHMENT A

Recommended Air Pollution Emission Reduction Measures for Warehouses and Distribution Centers

The California Air Resources Board (CARB) recommends developers and government planners use all existing and emerging zero to near-zero emission technologies during project construction and operation to minimize public exposure to air pollution. Below are some measures, currently recommended by CARB, specific to warehouse and distribution center projects. These recommendations are subject to change as new zero-emission technologies become available.

Recommended Construction Measures

1. Ensure the cleanest possible construction practices and equipment are used. This includes eliminating the idling of diesel-powered equipment and providing the necessary infrastructure (e.g., electrical hookups) to support zero and near-zero equipment and tools.
2. Implement, and plan accordingly for, the necessary infrastructure to support the zero and near-zero emission technology vehicles and equipment that will be operating on site. Necessary infrastructure may include the physical (e.g., needed footprint), energy, and fueling infrastructure for construction equipment, on-site vehicles and equipment, and medium-heavy and heavy-heavy duty trucks.
3. In construction contracts, include language that requires all off-road diesel-powered equipment used during construction to be equipped with Tier 4 or cleaner engines, except for specialized construction equipment in which Tier 4 engines are not available. In place of Tier 4 engines, off-road equipment can incorporate retrofits such that emission reductions achieved equal or exceed that of a Tier 4 engine.
4. In construction contracts, include language that requires all off-road equipment with a power rating below 19 kilowatts (e.g., plate compactors, pressure washers) used during project construction be battery powered.
5. In construction contracts, include language that requires all heavy-duty trucks entering the construction site, during the grading and building construction phases be model year 2014 or later. All heavy-duty haul trucks should also meet CARB's lowest optional low-NO_x standard starting in the year 2022.¹

¹ In 2013, CARB adopted optional low-NO_x emission standards for on-road heavy-duty engines. CARB encourages engine manufacturers to introduce new technologies to reduce NO_x emissions below the current mandatory on-road heavy-duty diesel engine emission standards for model year 2010 and later. CARB's optional low-NO_x emission standard is available at: <https://www.arb.ca.gov/msprog/onroad/optionnox/optionnox.htm>.

6. In construction contracts, include language that requires all construction equipment and fleets to be in compliance with all current air quality regulations. CARB is available to assist in implementing this recommendation.

Recommended Operation Measures

1. Include contractual language in tenant lease agreements that requires tenants to use the cleanest technologies available, and to provide the necessary infrastructure to support zero-emission vehicles and equipment that will be operating on site.
2. Include contractual language in tenant lease agreements that requires all loading/unloading docks and trailer spaces be equipped with electrical hookups for trucks with transport refrigeration units (TRU) or auxiliary power units. This requirement will substantially decrease the amount of time that a TRU powered by a fossil-fueled internal combustion engine can operate at the project site. Use of zero-emission all-electric plug-in TRUs, hydrogen fuel cell transport refrigeration, and cryogenic transport refrigeration are encouraged and can also be included in lease agreements.²
3. Include contractual language in tenant lease agreements that requires all TRUs entering the project site be plug-in capable.
4. Include contractual language in tenant lease agreements that requires future tenants to exclusively use zero-emission light and medium-duty delivery trucks and vans.
5. Include contractual language in tenant lease agreements requiring all TRUs, trucks, and cars entering the Project site be zero-emission.
6. Include contractual language in tenant lease agreements that requires all service equipment (e.g., yard hostlers, yard equipment, forklifts, and pallet jacks) used within the project site to be zero-emission. This equipment is widely available.
7. Include contractual language in tenant lease agreements that requires all heavy-duty trucks entering or on the project site to be model year 2014 or later, expedite a transition to zero-emission vehicles, and be fully zero-emission beginning in 2030.

² CARB's Technology Assessment for Transport Refrigerators provides information on the current and projected development of TRUs, including current and anticipated costs. The assessment is available at: https://www.arb.ca.gov/msprog/tech/techreport/tru_07292015.pdf.

8. Include contractual language in tenant lease agreements that requires the tenant be in, and monitor compliance with, all current air quality regulations for on-road trucks including CARB's Heavy-Duty (Tractor-Trailer) Greenhouse Gas Regulation,³ Periodic Smoke Inspection Program (PSIP),⁴ and the Statewide Truck and Bus Regulation.⁵
9. Include contractual language in tenant lease agreements restricting trucks and support equipment from idling longer than five minutes while on site.
10. Include contractual language in tenant lease agreements that limits on-site TRU diesel engine runtime to no longer than 15 minutes. If no cold storage operations are planned, include contractual language and permit conditions that prohibit cold storage operations unless a health risk assessment is conducted and the health impacts fully mitigated.
11. Include rooftop solar panels for each proposed warehouse to the extent feasible, with a capacity that matches the maximum allowed for distributed solar connections to the grid.

³ In December 2008, CARB adopted a regulation to reduce greenhouse gas emissions by improving the fuel efficiency of heavy-duty tractors that pull 53-foot or longer box-type trailers. The regulation applies primarily to owners of 53-foot or longer box-type trailers, including both dry-van and refrigerated-van trailers, and owners of the heavy-duty tractors that pull them on California highways. CARB's Heavy-Duty (Tractor-Trailer) Greenhouse Gas Regulation is available at: <https://www.arb.ca.gov/cc/hdghg/hdghg.htm>.

⁴ The PSIP program requires that diesel and bus fleet owners conduct annual smoke opacity inspections of their vehicles and repair those with excessive smoke emissions to ensure compliance. CARB's PSIP program is available at: <https://www.arb.ca.gov/enf/hdvip/hdvip.htm>.

⁵ The regulation requires that newer heavier trucks and buses must meet particulate matter filter requirements beginning January 1, 2012. Lighter and older heavier trucks must be replaced starting January 1, 2015. By January 1, 2023, nearly all trucks and buses will need to have 2010 model year engines or equivalent. CARB's Statewide Truck and Bus Regulation is available at: <https://www.arb.ca.gov/msprog/onrdiesel/onrdiesel.htm>.